

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 10084445 5

CASEBOOK ON CANADIAN INSOLVENCY AND RECEIVERSHIP LAW

PROFESSOR JACOB S. ZIEGEL

with the assistance of Jonathan Yen and Paul Veugelers

FALL 1989

The materials reproduced in this casebook  
are for the use of the students at the  
Faculty of Law, University of Toronto,  
and are not for commercial sale.

LAW LIBRARY

SEP 6 1989

FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO


CASEBOOK ON CANADIAN INSOLVENCY AND RECEIVERSHIP LAW

PROFESSOR JACOB S. ZIEGEL

with the assistance of Jonathan Yen and Paul Veugelers

FALL 1989

The materials reproduced in this casebook  
are for the use of the students at the  
Faculty of Law, University of Toronto,  
and are not for commercial sale.



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

PREFACE TO 1988 EDITION

The materials in this volume, collated under considerable pressure, are designed for an introductory one-semester, two-hours-a-week seminar on Canadian bankruptcy and receivership law.

I owe two particular debts. One is to Jonathan Yen (U. of T., LL.B. 1987) for shouldering much of the burden of compiling the materials; the other is to the editors of Gertner, Springman, McGuinness, Morrison, Stewart and Laskin, Debtor and Creditor, 3rd ed. (1987), and especially to Jody Morrison and George Stewart for facilitating my task of selecting suitable bankruptcy cases.

J.S.Z.

10.8.88

PREFACE TO 1989 EDITION

The 1988 edition has been updated to take account of important case law and other developments and to include some problem situations for discussion in the Seminar.

I am grateful to Paul Veugelers, U of T, LL.B.I., and Richard Kramer, an Osgoode Hall Law School student, for their respective assistance with these changes.

J.S.Z.

10.8.89

CASEBOOK ON CANADIAN INSOLVENCY AND RECEIVERSHIP LAW, FALL 1989SYLLABUS AND TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page No.</u>
Preface	i
Selected Bibliography	xiii
 Week 1 Sept. 6. THE OBJECTIVES OF BANKRUPTCY LAW, CANADIAN HISTORY, AND CURRENT PROCEDURES FOR MAKING A PERSON BANKRUPT	
A. Objectives & History of Bankruptcy Law	
Extracts, Jackson, <u>The Logic and Limits of Bankruptcy Law</u> .....	1
Extracts, <u>Tassé Report</u> , "The History of Bankruptcy".....	12
<u>Id.</u> , "The Present Canadian Legislation".....	18
<u>Id.</u> , "The Canadian Legislation Since Confederation".....	23
"Bankruptcy Statistics".....	29
 B. Commencement of Bankruptcy Proceedings:	
1. Involuntary Bankruptcy:	
R.S.C. 1985: 42-46, 2 (definition of "locality of debtor"), 12(1), 187(9) to (11)	
<u>Re Holmes and Sinclair</u> .....	33

<u>Re Cedarhurst Properties Ltd.</u> .....	36
<u>Re Gaudet</u> .....	40

2. Voluntary Bankruptcy

R.S.C. 1985: ss.49, 42(2), 181, 155, 2. (definition of "insolvent person", "locality of a debtor", "person" and "corporation").

3. Consequences of Receiving Order/Assignment

R.S.C. 1975, ss.69(1), stay of proceedings, 70(1) precedence over judgment, execution, etc., 71(2) vesting of property; 73, effect on executions and seizure for rents or taxes.

Week 2 Sept. 13. COLLECTION OF BANKRUPTCY ESTATE & PROPERTY EXCLUDED THEREFROM

R.S.C. 1985: 67-68, 70-75.

1. "Property" vesting in trustee - exceptions thereto

<u>Re Ritenburg; Ritenburg v. Crown Trust Company</u> .....	45
<u>Deloitte, Haskins &amp; Sells Limited v. Graham</u> .....	49

2. Exempt Property

<u>Re Neuls and Neuls; Touche Ross Limited v. First City Trust Company</u> .....	53
Extract, <u>Tassé Report</u> , "Exemptions" .....	62
Extract, Bill C-17, 1984, s. 158.....	63

## 3. Property subject to a trust:

R.S.C. 1985: s.67.

James F. Lawrie & Company Limited v. Moffat ..... 64Royal Bank of Canada v. 216200 Alberta Ltd. ..... 68  
(See also infra Week 4)

## Week 3 Sept. 20. TREATMENT OF SECURED CREDITORS

1. Ziegel & Garton: Statistical Profile of  
Creditors in Bankruptcy.....71a

## 2. Property subject to a security interest

R.S.C. 1985: ss.71(2), 2 (definition of "secured creditor")

Re Bright .....72Re Szeles .....79Extract, Ziegel, Geva & Cuming, Commercial &  
Consumer Transactions, 2nd ed.....83Extracts from the Ontario Personal Property Security Act,  
1989, ss. 1-2; 9-15.....83aExtract, Varley, "Receivership: The Contest  
Between Secured and General Creditors".....90

Goode, "Is the Law Too Favourable to Secured Creditors?" .....94

## 3. Treatment of Secured Creditors under the Act

R.S.C. 1985: ss.127,128,132,133.

Extract, Houlden & Morawetz, Bankruptcy Law of Canada.....107Re Ryan .....109



✓ Week 4 Sept. 27. STATUTORY TRUSTS AND PREFERENTIAL GOVERNMENT  
LIEN CLAIMS

R.S.C. 1985: ss.136(1), 67.

<u>Deputy Minister of Revenue v. Paul Rainville</u> .....	112
<u>Deloitte Haskins and Sells Limited v. W.C.B.</u> .....	116
<u>British Columbia v. Henfrey Samson Belair Ltd.</u> .....	123
<u>Bank of Montreal v. Scott Road Enterprises</u> .....	140
Extract, Bill C-17, 1984, ss. 265(1), 265(4)(i), 270.....	148
Extract, <u>Advisory Committee Report</u> , "Crown Priority".....	149
Bogart, "Statutory Claims and PPS Legislation: A Proposal"....	153
Plumb, "The New Federal Tax Lien Law".....	165
U.S. Internal Revenue Code, ss. 6321-6323.....	169

Week 5 Oct. 4. AVOIDANCE AND REVIEW OF ANTECEDENT TRANSACTIONS

R.S.C. 1985: ss.38, 68(1)

(a) Avoidance of Security Interests

OPPSA 1989: s. 20

<u>Re Bellini Manufacturing and Importing Ltd.</u> .....	177
<u>International Harvester v. Touche Ross</u> .....	180
Notes.....	188

(b) Settlements

R.S.C. 1985: ss.91,92,93

	<u>Re Whetstone</u> .....	190
(c)	Reviewable Transactions	
	R.S.C. 1985: ss.100 & 101	
	Extract, B.C.L.R.C. Report.....	198
	<u>Clarkson v. White</u> .....	207
	Extract, Bill C-17, 1984, ss. 169 - 175.....	210
(d)	Preferences	
	R.S.C. 1985: s.95.	
	<u>Hudson v. Benallack</u> .....	212
	<u>Re Van Der Liek</u> .....	216
	<u>Fraudulent Conveyances Act</u> , R.S.O. 1980, c. 176.....	218
	Extract, B.C.L.R.C. Report.....	220
(e)	Protected Transactions	
	R.S.C. 1985: s.97.	
(f)	Interaction of Federal and Provincial Legislation and Constitutional Issues	
	<u>Robinson v. Countrywide Factors Ltd.</u> .....	226
	<u>Pacaar Financial Services v. Sinco Trucking</u> .....	234

Week 6 Oct. 11. DISTRIBUTION OF BANKRUPT'S ESTATE: PREFERRED CLAIMS  
(See also, supra, Week 4)

R.S.C. 1985: 136(1)

(a) Landlord's Claim

In re Gingras .....243

(b) Wage Earners' Priorities

Extracts, Advisory Committee Report, "Wage Earners  
Protection"..... 247

Brown, "Final Report of the Commission of Inquiry  
into Wage Protection in Insolvency Situations" ..... 261

Gleig, "Unpaid Wages in Bankruptcy" ..... 269

See also materials, supra, Week 4

(c) Directors' Liabilities for Unpaid Wages and other  
Benefits

OBCA s. 131 ..... 280

CBCA s. 114 ..... 281

(d) Recommendations for Reform

Extract, Tassé Report..... 282

Week 7 Oct. 18. CONSEQUENCES OF BANKRUPTCY AND DISCHARGE  
FROM BANKRUPTCY

(a) Consequences of Bankruptcy

<u>Vachon v. Canada Employment and Immigration Commission</u> .....	286
<u>Amanda Designs Boutique Limited v. Charisma Fashion</u> .....	294

(b) Discharge from Bankruptcy

R.S.C. 1985: ss.169-182

<u>Kozack v. Richter</u> .....	301
<u>Consumers' Gas Co. v. Stewart</u> .....	305
<u>Re McAfee</u> .....	308
Ferron, "The Approach of the Courts to the Discharge of Bankrupt Judgment Debtors" .....	319
Extract, Jackson, <u>The Logic and Limits of Bankruptcy Law</u> .....	330

Week 8 Oct. 25. ALTERNATIVES TO BANKRUPTCY: COMMERCIAL REORGANIZATIONS

R.S.C. 1985: Part III

<u>Fisher Oil &amp; Gas v. Guaranty Bank &amp; Trust Company</u> .....	345
<u>Henfrey Samson Belair Ltd. v. A.G. Can.</u> .....	349
Extract, Houlden & Morawetz, <u>Bankruptcy Law of Canada</u> .....	352
<u>Companies' Creditors Arrangement Act</u> , R.S.C. 1970, c. C-25 ....	354
Crozier, "Good Faith and the CCAA".....	358
Leonard, "Recent Developments and Trends in Financial Reorganizations".....	365

Extract, Advisory Committee Report, "Stay of Proceedings  
by Secured Creditors"..... 380

Quinn, "Corporate Reorganization and Strategic Behaviour...".. 386

Week 9 Nov. 1. COMMERCIAL REORGANIZATIONS AND CHAPTER 11 OF THE U.S.  
BANKRUPTCY CODE

There will be a separate handout of materials

Week 10 Nov. 8th CONSUMER ARRANGEMENTS AND CONSUMER BANKRUPTCIES

R.S.C. 1985: Part X

Orderly Payment of Debts Statistics ..... 415

Ziegel, "Consumer Bankruptcies" ..... 416

Extract, Brighton & Connidis, "Consumer Bankrupts in Canada".. 421

Bill C-17, 1984, Part III ..... 436

Problem..... 444

Week 11 Nov. 15. RECEIVERSHIPS AND FIXED AND FLOATING CHARGES

A. FLOATING CHARGES

I. The Floating Charge at Common Law and under the  
PPSA

1. Common Law Position

Pennington, "The Genesis of the Floating Charge" ..... 446

R. in Right of B.C. v. F.B.D.B. ..... 450

2. Crystallization of Floating Charge

The Queen in Right of British Columbia v. Consolidated Churchill Copper Corp. Ltd. ..... 461

Mackay and Hughes (1973) Ltd. v. Martin Potatoes Inc.... 473

3. Demand for Payment: How much time is the debtor entitled to?

Ronald Elwyn Lister Ltd. v. Dunlop Canada Ltd. ..... 478

Mister Broadloom v. Bank of Montreal..... 482

Bank of Baroda v. Panessar ..... 484

II. The Floating Charge under the Ont. PPSA

OPPSA ss. 9, 11, 19, 20, 25, 33, 55

Re Huxley Catering Limited v. CIBC ..... 489

Royal Bank of Canada v. G.M. Homes Inc. ..... 492

Notes ..... 493

Ziegel, "Recent and Prospective Developments in the PPS Area" ..... 494

Week 12 Nov. 22. B. STATUS, DUTIES AND POWERS OF RECEIVERS

1. Definition and History

Extract, Picarda, The Law Relating to Receivers and Managers 498

2.	Court Appointed and Privately Appointed Receivers: Practical and Legal Considerations	
	Extract, Bennett, <u>Receiverships</u> .....	501
	<u>Royal Bank of Canada v. White Cross Properties Ltd.</u> .....	503
	<u>Federal Trust Company v. Frisina</u> .....	506
3.	Differences Between Receiver and Manager	
	<u>In re Manchester and Milford Railway Co.</u> .....	510
4.	Duties and Powers of Receivers	
	CBCA ss. 94 - 95 (Part VIII).....	515
	<u>Parsons v. The Sovereign Bank of Canada</u> .....	516
	<u>Re TIW Industries Ltd. and Clarkson Co. Ltd.</u> .....	519
5.	Status of Receivers as Agent of Company	
	<u>Peat Marwick Ltd. v. Consumers' Gas Co.</u> .....	522
	<u>Sperry Inc. v. C.I.B.C.</u> .....	529
6.	Termination of Receivership	
	Extract, Bennett, <u>Receiverships</u> .....	534
Week 13	Nov. 29. RECEIVERSHIPS (Cont'd)	
7.	Rules with respect to realization	
	<u>J. &amp; W. Investments Ltd. v. Black</u> .....	543

Cuckmere Brick Co. Ltd. v. Mutual Finance Ltd...... 548

OPPSA 1989 s.63

8. Bankruptcy and Receivership

Extract, Bennett, Receiverships ..... 556

Gosling v. Gaskell ..... 558

Extract, Advisory Committee, "Receivers and Secured Creditors" 562

9. Conflict of Laws Aspects

C.A. Kennedy Co. Ltd. v. Stibbe-Monte Ltd...... 576

Clarkson Co. Ltd. v. Rockwell ..... 585

10. Problem..... 589

Week 14 Dec. 6. INTERNATIONAL BANKRUPTCIES AND REORGANIZATIONS

Robertson, "Enforcement and Other Problems in International  
Insolvencies"..... 595

Gitlin & Flaschen, "The International Void in the  
Law of Multinational Bankruptcies" ..... 612

Bill C-17, 1984, ss. 314 - 317 ..... 627

US Bankruptcy Code 1978, s. 304 ..... 629



SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. TEXTBOOKS AND MONOGRAPHS: CANADA

T.G. Anderson, Proprietary and Quasi-proprietary Rights Arising upon Insolvency, University of Toronto (1981).

Bankruptcy: Present Problems and Future Perspectives, Faculty of Law, McGill University (1986).

D.G. Baird & T.H. Jackson, Cases, Problems and Materials on Bankruptcy, (1985).

F. Bennett, Receiverships, Carswell (1985).

F. Bennett, Bankruptcy Legislation, CCH Can., 1989.

J.W. Brighton, Consumer Bankrupts in Canada, Consumer and Corporate Affairs Canada (1982).

Business Law: Commercial Insolvency, CBAO (1983).

Duncan and Honsberger, Bankruptcy in Canada, 3rd ed., Canadian Legal Authors Ltd. (1961).

Gertner, Springman et al. Debtor and Creditor: Cases and Commentary, 3rd ed. Carswell (1987).

Houlden and Morawetz, Bankruptcy Law of Canada, 3rd ed., Carswell (1989).

Impact of Insolvency on Business Relationships, CBAO (1987).

Is Bankruptcy Merely "Back to Business"?, CBAO (1983).

Mega International Insolvencies: Are They "Bailouts", Rescues, or Merely Financial Footwork?, CBAO (1983).

Priorities: Who Gets What After the Fall, CBAO (1984).

Staying Alive: Proposals and Reorganizations, OBCA (1984).

B. TEXTBOOKS AND MONOGRAPHS: ENGLAND AND AUSTRALIA

- M. Crystal, A Handbook on Bankruptcy and Deeds of Arrangement Law and Practice, London: (1978).
- P.G. Earles, A Guide to Bankruptcy, Professional Books (1984).
- R.M. Goode, Proprietary Rights and Insolvency in Sales Transactions, Sweet & Maxwell (1985).
- W.W. Kerr, Kerr on the Law and Practice as to the Receivers, 16th ed., Sweet & Maxwell (1983).
- G. Lightman, The Law of Receivers of Companies, Sweet & Maxwell, (1986).
- D. Milman, Corporate Insolvency: Law and Practice, Sweet & Maxwell, (1987).
- J. O'Donovan, Company Receivers and Managers, The Law Book Company Limited (1981).
- H.A.P. Picarda, The Law Relating to Receivers and Managers, Butterworths (1984).
- P.W.D. Redmon, Bankruptcy Law, 7th ed., Macdonald & Evans (1977).
- P. Totty, Corporate Insolvency, McGraw-Hill (1982).

C. TEXTBOOKS AND MONOGRAPHS: U.S.

- Bankruptcy Reform, American Enterprise Institute for Public Policy Reform (1978).
- J.R. Blinn, Bankruptcy Strategies for Lenders, Professional Education Systems (1987).
- P. Blumberg, The Law of Corporate Groups: Problems in the Bankruptcy Reorganization of Parent and Subsidiary Corporations, Little Brown (1985).
- W.M. Collier, Collier Bankruptcy Manual, Matthew Bender (1979).
- D.R. Cowans, Bankruptcy Law and Practice, West Publishing (1986).
- T.H. Jackson, The Logic and Limits of Bankruptcy law, Harvard University Press (1986).

- L. Kruger & Quittner, Bankruptcy Practice and Procedure, Practising Law Institute (1985).
- M.S. Lurey, Lending Transactions and the Bankruptcy Code, 1987, Practising Law Institute (1987).
- A.L. Paskay, Handbook for Trustees and Receivers in Bankruptcy, Bender (1978).
- Quittner & L. Kruger, Current Developments in Bankruptcy and Reorganization, 1986, Practising Law Institute (1986).

#### D. ARTICLES

- W.A. Bogart "Statutory Claims and Personal Property Security Legislation: A Proposal" (1983) C.B.L.J. 129.
- L.J. Crozier "Good Faith and the Companies' Creditors Arrangement Act" (1989), 15 Can. Bus. L.J. 89.
- J.M. Ferron "The Approach of the Courts to the Discharge of Bankrupt Judgment Debtors" (1985) 61 C.B.R. (N.S.) 134.
- A. Giroux "The Use of the Bankruptcy Act by Secured Creditors" Meredith Memorial Lectures 1985, 232.
- R.A. Gitlin "The International Void in the Law of Multinational Bankruptcies" (1987) 42 Bus. Law 307.
- D.B. Gleig "Unpaid Wages in Bankruptcy" (1987) 21 U.B.C.L.R. 61.
- R.M. Goode "Is the Law Too Favourable to Secured Creditors?" (1983-84) 8 C.B.L.J. 53.
- A.K. Kemp-Gee "Insolvency in Practice: A Receiver's View" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1982, 615.
- E.B. Leonard "Recent Developments and Trends in Financial Reorganizations" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1985, 161.
- W. Meckling "Financial Markets, Default and Bankruptcy: The Role of the State" (1977) 41 Law & Contemporary Problems 13.
- R.G. Marantz "Current Trends in Canadian Bankruptcy Law" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1982, 659.

- M. Mendelsohn "Canada: A Secured Creditor's Paradise?" Meredith Memorial Lectures 1985, 105.
- D. Milman "Receivers as Agents" (1981) 44 M.L.R. 658.
- J. O'Donovan "The Duties and Liabilities of a Receiver and Manager Appointed Out of Court" (1979) 12 M.U.L.R. 52.
- R. Pennington "The Genesis of the Floating Charge" (1960) 23 M.L.R. 630.
- A. Petomaa "Constitutional Validity of Provincial Legislation Subordinating Unperfected Security Interests to Trustees in Bankruptcy" 42 C.B.R. (N.S.) 104.
- W. T. Plumb "The New Federal Tax Lien Law" (1966-67) 22 Business Lawyers 271.
- J.J. Quinn "Corporate Reorganization and Strategic Behaviour: An Economic Analysis of Canadian Insolvency Law and Recent Proposals for Reform" (1985) 23 O.H.L.J. 1.
- R.N. Robertson "Legal Problems on Reorganization of Major Financial and Commercial Debtors" in Mega International Insolvencies: Are They "Bailouts", Rescues, or Merely Financial Footwork?", CBAO (1983).
- M. Scott "The Provinces and the Bankruptcy Act: An End Run" Meredith Memorial Lectures 1985, 73.
- M.G. Shanker "The Worthier Creditors (and a Cheer for the King)" (1975-76) 1 C.B.L.J. 340.
- M.A. Springman "The B.C.L.R.C. Report on Fraudulent Conveyances and Preferences" (1989), 15 CBLJ 180.
- H.W. Sterling, "Seizures Under Demand Debentures" (1985) 53 C.B.R. (N.S.) 129.
- J.R. Varley "Receivership: The Contest Between Secured and General Creditors" in Debtor-Creditor Law: Practice and Doctrine (Springman and Gertner, eds. 1985).
- J.R. Varley "Recent Developments and Emerging Trends in the Enforcement of Security - The Receiver Besieged" in Special Lectures of the LSUC 1985, 181.
- J.S. Ziegel "Consumer Bankruptcies" (1972) 20 Chitty's L.J. 325.

- J.S. Ziegel "Recent and Prospective Developments in the Personal Property Security Area and the Recommendations of the Ontario Advisory Committee" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1985, 1.
- J.S. Ziegel "The Supreme Court of Canada Scuttles the Deemed Trust in Bankruptcy" (1989), 15 CBLJ \_\_\_\_.

## E. REPORTS

Brighton & Connidis, Consumer Bankrupts in Canada, Policy Research, Analysis and Liason Directorate, Policy Coordination Bureau, Consumer and Corporate Affairs Canada.

D.J.M. Brown Final Report of the Commission of Inquiry into Wage Protection in Insolvency Situations, (1985).

L.R.C.B.C.; Fraudulent Conveyances and Preferences, Working Paper No.53 (1986).

Report of the Advisory Committee on Bankruptcy and Insolvency: Proposed Bankruptcy Act Amendments (Advisory Committee Report), Ministry of Supply and Services Canada (1986).

Report of the Study Committee on Bankruptcy and Insolvency Legislation Canada 1970 (Tassé Report), Ministry of Supply and Services Canada (1970).

Report of the Review Committee on Insolvency Law and Practice, Cmnd. 8558, (1982).

## F. STATUTES: CANADA

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985, c. B-3.

Companies' Creditors Arrangement Act, R.S.C. 1985, c. C-36.

Farm Debt Review Act, S.C. 1986, c. C-33.

Fraudulent Conveyances Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 176.

Winding Up Act, R.S.C. 1985, c. W-11.

An Act Respecting Bankruptcy and Insolvency, Bill-17, 1984.

G. STATUTES: ENGLAND

Insolvency Act, 1986.

H. STATUTES: U.S.

Bankruptcy Reform Act of 1978, Pub. L. No. 95-598, 92 stat. 2549 (1978)  
(codified at 11 U.S.C. ss. 101 et seq.)

The Bankruptcy Amendments and Federal Judgeship Act of 1984, Pub. L. No. 98-353, 98 Stat. 333 (1984) (enacted July 10, 1984)